The difficulties of a peer-to-peer VPN on the hostile Internet

Brussel, February 6, 2010

Guus Sliepen

guus@tinc-vpn.org
Tinc development started in September 1997, after introduction of ethertap in Linux 2.1.53.

Current features:

- Connects multiple sites together
- Can act as router (layer 3) or switch (layer 2)
- Full support for IPv6
- No central server
- You configure some endpoints, tinc will do the rest

Modus operandi:

- Metadata exchanges via TCP
- VPN packets directly via UDP
- Fall back to TCP if UDP is not possible
The competition:

- CIPE†
- VTun†
- IPsec
- OpenVPN
- Hamachi

But also:

- GVPE
- CloudVPN
- SocialVPN
- n2n
- VDE
Network before VPN is configured:

Blue cloud: the Internet
Black circles: VPN nodes
Initial connections configured by user:

Green lines: initial connections
The difficulties of a peer-to-peer VPN on the hostile Internet

Guus Sliepen

Introduction

Communicating over the Internet

The problem of NAT

The problem of MTU

Other problems

Authentication and authorization

The end

Full mesh created by tinc:

Black lines: UDP tunnels
Reality is not so nice:

Red arcs: NAT
Red line: ISP blocking traffic
Dotted lines: failed connections

The difficulties of a peer-to-peer VPN on the hostile Internet
Guus Sliepen

Introduction
Communicating over the Internet
The problem of NAT
The problem of MTU
Other problems
Authentication and authorization
The end
The problem of NAT:

- Source address and port change
- Incoming connections blocked

Solutions:

- Routing via non-NAT node (not efficient)
- Port forwarding (not always possible, manual work)
- UPnP (needs router support, complex)
- STUN/ICE (not always possible, complex)
Two nodes behind NAT:

Both nodes can talk to a third node. NAT changes ports, nodes cannot talk to each other.
STUN in action:

Third node tells other nodes about their addresses and ports. Nodes connect to each other using this information.
The problem of packet fragmentation:

- MTU inside tunnel smaller than outside
- Outer layer fragments bad for performance
- Some firewalls/ISPs block fragments

Solution:

- Determine path MTU between nodes
- Generate ICMP Fragmentation Needed packets
- Should work for all IPv4/IPv6 traffic
- Fall back to TCP for other traffic
The problem of firewalls/ISPs blocking ICMP:

- **ICMP Fragmentation Needed does not work!**
- Happens when network traffic leaves the VPN (for example, when having default gateway on VPN)

Solution:

- Clamp MSS field in TCP packets to path MTU
- Works only for TCP
Other problems:

- Frequently changing IP addresses
  - use dyndns
  - cache & forward known addresses between nodes

- Only allowing certain ports, like HTTP
  - tunnel over ICMP/DNS/HTTPS

- ISPs dropping/delaying small UDP packets
  - because they think it’s VoIP!
  - severely slows down TCP streams inside tunnel
Authentication and authorization

- Authentication = proving who you are
- Authorization = proving you are allowed to do something

Two well known (mostly authentication) methods:

- X.509 certificates
  - centralized approach
  - focused on identities (LDAP like), and URLs
- OpenPGP keys
  - decentralized approach
  - focused on email addresses
The difficulties of a peer-to-peer VPN on the hostile Internet

Guus Sliepen

Introduction
Communicating over the Internet
The problem of NAT
The problem of MTU
Other problems
Authentication and authorization
The end

We need OpenPGP-like features:
- Completely decentralized
- Web of trust

We need more than OpenPGP can offer:
- Authorise anything, not just email
- Everyone can add/remove authorizations
- Negative authorization: forbid things
- Group decisions

We need OpenPGP-like features:
- Completely decentralized
- Web of trust

We need more than OpenPGP can offer:
- Authorise anything, not just email
- Everyone can add/remove authorizations
- Negative authorization: forbid things
- Group decisions
libfides: lightweight p2p authorization framework

- Create and maintain repository of many certificates
  "X said at time T that Y is allowed to do Z"
- Newer certificates overrule older ones
  "X said at time T+1 that Y is not allowed to do Z"
- Make it simple to query the repository
  "Is Y allowed to do Z?"
- Fast & easy synchronization of repositories
- Application does not need to know about crypto
- Libfides itself uses only ECCDSA primitives
- Still in alpha stage.
The difficulties of a peer-to-peer VPN on the hostile Internet

Guus Sliepen

Introduction

Communicating over the Internet

The problem of NAT

The problem of MTU

Other problems

Authentication and authorization

The end

Conclusions:

- The Internet eats your packets.
- Lots of techniques necessary to work around it.
- Distributed authorization is a challenge.

That’s it.

- Questions?

Visit the website:

http://tinc-vpn.org/